

You Decide**Part 1: The Case**

The students in Mr. Lee's 4th-period algebra class took their midterm test on Thursday. When Mr. Lee was correcting the tests Thursday evening, he noticed something odd: Two students, Cameron and John, had both gotten 93% on the test, and their answers were nearly identical. Although they sat on opposite sides of the classroom and didn't seem to be friends, Mr. Lee suspected that the boys may have cheated somehow.

Mr. Lee recalled that on Wednesday, both the boys, along with another student, Maya, had stayed after class to ask him questions about the material. He had helped Maya first, then John, and then Cameron. He remembered this clearly because Cameron had always been a shy, quiet student who had never before stayed to ask a question.

When Mr. Lee discussed his suspicion with the school principal on Monday, Principal Brown said she had seen John waiting outside Mr. Lee's classroom on Wednesday morning and then had watched as Cameron came out and the two boys walked together toward the cafeteria. She had paid special attention because she had disciplined John earlier in the month for fighting with another student.

Principal Brown decided to call each of the boys into her office on Friday afternoon. She talked with John first, who said that he and Cameron had studied together for the test on Wednesday afternoon and that was why their answers were similar. He denied cheating in any way.

When Principal Brown talked with Cameron, he also denied cheating. He said he had studied harder than usual by himself, which was why he got a 93%. After a couple more minutes of questioning, however, Cameron changed his story. He nervously explained that when Mr. Lee had turned his back to help Maya after class on Wednesday, Cameron had noticed that the test answers were on top of the filing cabinet, and he had taken a quick picture of them with his phone. He claimed that he had not shared the answers with John or anyone else.

Principal Brown asked to see both boys' phones, but she did not find a picture of the test answers on either of them. Cameron's phone battery was almost dead.

Based on what she had learned, Principal Brown decided to suspend Cameron for cheating. On Monday morning, however, Cameron and his parents came into her office. Cameron said that he actually hadn't cheated. He said he had lied about taking the picture because he was afraid of what John would do to him if he didn't take the blame. He told her that John had mentioned seeing the test answers on the filing cabinet; but, as far as Cameron knew, John had not taken a picture of them either.

Principal Brown must now decide: Was Cameron guilty of cheating?

Part 2: Analyzing the Evidence

1. What evidence is present in this case? List each piece of evidence in the first column below. Then analyze what that evidence tells you and what weaknesses it may have.

Evidence	What does this evidence tell you?	What weaknesses does this evidence have?
<i>Two tests with same score</i>	<i>The students knew the same answers. They might have cheated.</i>	<i>Can't know reason for same answers. There could be other explanations.</i>

2. Which pieces of evidence indicate that Cameron is guilty? Mark those with "G." Which indicate that Cameron is not guilty? Mark those with "NG."

3. Looking at all the evidence together, what can you know for certain about the case?

4. What is still unknown?

Part 3: Drawing Conclusions

1. Based on the evidence, does your group think Cameron is guilty or not guilty of cheating? What are the reasons for your decision?

2. What kind of evidence was more convincing: the physical evidence (like the tests or the phone battery), the eyewitness accounts or the confession?

3. Are you completely convinced that Cameron cheated? If so, why? If you have any doubt, what additional evidence might have helped you be more certain?